DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 076 966 CS 000 553

AUTHOR	Eller, William, Comp.; Wolf, Judith G., Comp.
TITLE	Critical Reading: A Broader View; An Annotated Bibliography.
INSTITUTION	International Reading Association, Newark, Del.
PUB DATE	69
NOTE	16p.
AVAILABLE FROM	International Reading Assn., Six Tyre Ave., Newark, Del. (Order No. 318, $0.75 non-member, $0.50 member)
EDRS PRICE	MF-$0.65 HC-$3.29
DESCRIPTORS	*Annotated Bibliographies; *Critical Reading; *Critical Thinking; Developmental Reading; Elementary Education; Higher Education; Reading Comprehension; *Reading Instruction; Reading Processes; *Reading Skills; Secondary Education

ABSTRACT

The references listed in this annotated bibliography are organized into three major categories: (1) The Process of Critical Reading, (2) Research on Critical Reading, and (3) The Teaching of Critical Reading. The first category includes standard texts, theory-oriented volumes, a few books directed at the popular market, periodical articles, and evaluations of several sets of practice materials available in workbook form. The research cited in the second category is divided according to two themes: factors which influence critical reading ability and studies of instructional methodology. The last category lists four books on the subject of the teaching of critical thinking and reading and four articles on this same topic. (TO)

FILMED FROM BEST AVAILABLE COPY

ED 076966

CRITICAL READING: A BROADER VIEW

An Annotated Bibliography

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH, EDUCATION & WELFARE
NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF EDUCATION
THIS DOCUMENT HAS BEEN REPRODUCED EXACTLY AS RECEIVED FROM THE PERSON OR ORGANIZATION ORIGINATING IT. POINTS OF VIEW OR OPINIONS STATED DO NOT NECESSARILY REPRESENT OFFICIAL NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF EDUCATION POSITION OR POLICY

Compiled by William Eller
and
Judith G. Wolf
State University of New York at Buffalo
1969

Ramon Ross, *General Editor*

CONTENTS

1 Introduction
2 The Processes of Critical Reading
6 Research on Critical Reading
Factors Which Influence Critical Reading
Instructional Methodology
14 The Teaching of Critical Reading

Published by
INTERNATIONAL READING ASSOCIATION
Six Tyre Avenue Newark, Delaware 19711

CS 000 553

"PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE THIS COPYRIGHTED MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY
International Reading Association
TO ERIC AND ORGANIZATIONS OPERATING UNDER AGREEMENTS WITH THE NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF EDUCATION. FURTHER REPRODUCTION OUTSIDE THE ERIC SYSTEM REQUIRES PERMISSION OF THE COPYRIGHT OWNER."

INTRODUCTION

In recent months a number of professional educators have observed that the far-reaching functions of the federally financed ERIC system (Educational Resources Information Centers) have markedly reduced the need for the professional organizations to publish and distribute straightforward listings of references on major topics or themes as they have done in the past. More specifically, ERIC facilities for monitoring, searching, classifying, abstracting, and disseminating have rendered obsolete those bibliographies which are nonevaluative and which are based almost entirely on standard educational sources of the sort represented in the *Education Index*. Therefore, in the interest of maximum usefulness, the bibliography which follows includes references to publications outside the literature of professional education, and the citations are accompanied by evaluative annotations.

Because most scholarly publications include some lists of related references, it is not essential for a bibliography on the topic of critical reading to be exhaustive; it may not even be possible. Instead, the compilers of this bibliography have sought to include representation of a wide variety of theories and experiments on critical reading, so that a beginning student of the subject will be introduced to most of the major points of view and the pertinent research trends from the fields of social psychology, semantics, advertising, and philosophy, as well as professional education.

The references listed in this booklet are organized into three major categories: 1) The Processes of Critical Reading, 2) Research on Critical Reading, and 3) The Teaching of Critical Reading. Under each of these headings the larger publications such as hardbound books are listed before the shorter articles from the professional journals. All cited practice materials are listed in the first category (Processes) instead of the third (Teaching), because they are directed more at the learner-user than at the teacher.

THE PROCESSES OF CRITICAL READING

The books listed in the first part of this category include the standard texts such as those by Altick and Beardsley, some theory-oriented volumes by Terrell and by Allen and his associates, and a few books directed at the popular market. Following the second part, which is devoted to periodical articles, the third portion of this category focuses upon evaluations of several sets of practice materials available in workbook form. While the practice workbooks provide some instruction in the processes of critical reading, they also include exercise materials with which the reader can strengthen certain of his evaluative reading skills.

Books

ALLEN, RONALD R., JERRY D. FEEZEL, and FRED J. KAUFFELD. *A Taxonomy of Concepts and Critical Abilities Related to the Evaluation of Verbal Arguments.* Madison: Research and Development Center for Cognitive Learning, University of Wisconsin, 1967.

In preparation for a series of studies of the critical thinking abilities of high school students, Allen and his associates have developed a taxonomy of the critical thinking processes. Their rather sophisticated taxonomy is based on the Tuolmin model for the analysis of argument.

ALTICK, RICHARD S. *Preface to Critical Reading* (4th ed.). New York: Holt, Rinehart & Winston, 1960.

For a generation, the several editions of Altick's little book have provided college students with a comprehensive – yet interesting – treatment of critical reading as it is perceived by the professor of English. Emphasis is on word usages, logic, style, and propaganda techniques, with rather good illustrations of each, apparently drawn from Altick's vast collection of good and bad examples.

BAKER, SAMM SINCLAIR. *The Permissible Lie.* Cleveland: World Publishing, 1968.

Based on his thirty years in the advertising business, author Baker's exposé of Madison Avenue is well illustrated with examples of half-truths, exaggerations, and assorted other deceptions aimed at the uncritical reader of advertising. Although this volume is not unusually devastating in its criticism of the advertising industry, it was withdrawn from publication by *Reader's Digest Association* in a gesture of censorship which is an obvious obstruction to evaluative reading.

BEARDSLEY, MONROE C. *Thinking Straight* (3rd ed.). Englewood, New Jersey: Prentice-Hall, 1966.

In a style which suggests that he should have a joint appointment in the departments of philosophy and English, Beardsley begins with chapters which elucidate the characteristics of language which hinder or aid communication, and arrives at guidelines for precision in control of meaning. The physical properties of the book cause it to appear more academic than Altick's volume, but it may not really be any more difficult to read.

CHASE, STUART. *Guides to Straight Thinking* (3rd ed.). New York: Harper, 1956.

Written for the general (not the academic) market, Chase's treatment of thirteen of the frequently encountered logical fallacies includes examples taken from various facets of American life. Other illustrations of faulty reasoning are included in chapters which focus upon propaganda in the courtroom.

HUFF, DARRELL. *How to Lie With Statistics.* New York: Norton, 1954.

In spite of its disarming title and breezy style, this little book contains considerable material of practical value. In addition to assorted examples of the use and misuse of statistics in propaganda, a number of other logical fallacies are explained.

PACKARD, VANCE. *The Hidden Persuaders.* New York: David McKay, 1957.

With unusual candor and objectivity the author introduces the reader to a fascinating breed of men – the motivational researchers. Using insights from psychiatry and the social sciences these professional persuaders try to influence our behavior in an attempt to sell their products – consumer goods, attitudes, or candidates. Written nontechnically and with humor this absorbing book reveals their methods, influence, and manipulation. One of Packard's goals is to provide readers with some insulation.

TERRELL, D. B. *Logic: A Modern Introduction to Deductive Reasoning.* New York: Holt, Rinehart & Winston, 1967.

The recognition of psychological as well as logical aspects of deductive reasoning has led Terrell to include two chapters dealing with informal fallacies in her erudite and systematic study of traditional and modern logic. Emphasis on the psychological and linguistic sources of error has led to a regrouping of common fallacies into two major classifications: those originating in written language and those rooted in emotions. Although written specifically as a textbook for the student of logic, the Terrell volume will prove useful, interesting, and thought provoking to many types of academically oriented persons.

Articles

DALE, EDGAR. "The Critical Reader," *The News Letter,* 30, 4 (January 1965), 1-4. (Also available in *Critical Reading,* Martha L. King, Bernice D. Ellinger, and Willavene Wolf, editors. Philadelphia: Lippincott, 1967, 25-29.)

With succinct informality Dale describes the nine attributes of the critical reading process. Examples based on statements of well-known figures illustrate each characteristic.

ELLER, WILLIAM. "Fundamentals of Critical Reading," in Oscar S. Causey (Ed.), *The Reading Teacher's Reader.* New York: Ronald Press, 1958, 30-34.

Following some typical arguments in support of the importance of critical reading in a democracy, the author matches the essential skills and attitudes of critical reading against the obstructions to evaluative reading.

ENNIS, ROBERT H. "A Concept of Critical Thinking," *Harvard Educational Review,* 32 (Winter 1962), 81-111.

Clearly relating the aspects of critical reading to the fundamentals of logic, Ennis lists and clarifies nine major aspects of critical thinking. The purpose of the article is not to suggest teaching ideas but to present a theoretical analysis of the subject and to indicate ways people misconstrue statements.

SEAMANS, ELDON L. "The Language of Prejudice," *ETC: A Review of General Semantics,* Vol. 23, No. 2 (June 1966), 216-224.

The language employed to express prejudice is assigned to several categories, including language of self-disparagement and language of concern. Although essentially theoretical, the article is so organized that it is easy to understand and pleasant to read.

SKOLIMOWSKI, HENRYK. "The Semantic Environment in the Age of Advertising," *ETC: A Review of General Semantics,* Vol. 25, No. 1 (March 1968), 17-26.

Written from the viewpoint of a philosopher-semanticist, this scrutiny of some of the language of advertising points up some of the subtleties which make critical reading difficult even for the moderately sophisticated reader of the output of Madison Avenue.

Practice materials

DIEDERICH, PAUL B., and OSMOND E. PALMER. *Critical Thinking in Reading and Writing.* New York: Holt, Rinehart & Winson, 1955.

On the basis of experience as directors of the remedial English program at the University of Chicago, the authors have set up sixteen rather complex units of practice in reading and writing at a fairly sophisticated level. Each of the reading exercise selections is accompanied by several dozen comprehensive questions; not all of the questions require critical thinking as it is usually defined, but all demand comprehension in depth.

HILL, WALTER R., and WILLIAM ELLER. *Power in Reading Skills.* Belmont, California: Wadsworth, 1964, 137-176.

Practice in critical reading is provided by a series of exercises on 1) differentiating between fact and opinion, 2) discerning the author's purpose, and 3) determining the basis for reader response. Each of the three series begins with relatively easy exercises and progresses in difficulty to items which are rather challenging.

MYERS, R. E., and E. PAUL TORRANCE. *Invitations to Thinking and Doing.* Boston: Ginn, 1964.

Although the authors designed this booklet to foster the development of the creative abilities of elementary school pupils, many of the exercise activities – judging, comparing, questioning, analyzing, and perceiving relationships – are essential for critical thinking and reading. The expendable workbook provides abundant opportunities for pupils to defend and illustrate their responses, while the teachers' guide leads the teacher to flexible and creative modifications of the program. Other booklets in the Myers and Torrance series on creative thinking (Ginn) also include some practice in the subskills of critical reading.

SHERBOURNE, JULIA FLORENCE. *Toward Reading Comprehension.* Boston: D.C. Heath, 1958, 117-135.

Twenty exercises (with several questions each) provide opportunity for the reader to test his mastery of the dozen principles of critical reading which are explained briefly by the author. Many of the longer selections in the book are also used as bases for questions which provoke evaluative responses; in short, this manual includes much more critical reading practice material than the table of contents indicates.

STROUD, JAMES B., ROBERT B. AMMONS, and HENRY A. BAMMAN. *Improving Reading Ability* (2nd ed.). New York: Appleton-Century-Crofts, 1956, 98-109, 155-170.

Stroud's long-standing concern with reading comprehension is manifested in an assortment of exercises in critical reading. In addition, critical reading questions are scattered among the exercises directed at other comprehension skills and the practice materials at the end of this manual provide for critical reading of extended texts.

RESEARCH ON CRITICAL READING

The research cited in this segment of the bibliography is divided according to two themes: 1) factors which influence critical reading ability, and 2) studies of instructional methodology. Much of the respectable research on factors involved in critical reading has been done by social psychologists not primarily concerned with the critical skills but with communication, persuasibility, and attitude change, all of which are vital in the study of critical analysis. Certainly the outstanding series of books in this vein has been the *Yale Studies in Attitude and Communication* by Carl Hovland and his associates. Three of the Yale volumes are annotated in the itemization titled "Factors Which Influence Critical Reading Ability." An excellent summary of the relevant theories and research of the social psychologists is provided by Insko in his new volume, *Theories of Attitude Change.*

Noteworthy investigations into the instructional methodologies of critical reading are not numerous, but research programs being developed at two midwestern state universities seem to hold promise. At the elementary level, Wolf and her colleagues at Ohio State are continuing their study of critical reading instruction and measurement, and one phase of the total program is described in their report to the United States Office of Education. At the University of Wisconsin, again with federal support, Rott, Feezel, Allen, and others have been laying the groundwork for a thorough investigation of critical reading and thinking in the high school grades.

Factors Which Influence Critical Reading

Books

HOVLAND, C. I. *The Order of Presentation in Persuasion.* New Haven: Yale University Press, 1957.

Several variables in the content of a communication may be related to its efficacy. This volume in the Yale series is devoted to a consideration of the effects of order of presentation and its interaction with other factors. At the conclusion of a series of experiments Hovland presents summary statements.

HOVLAND, C. I., and I. L. JANIS (Eds.). *Personality and Persuasibility.* New Haven: Yale University Press, 1959.

The second volume in the Yale series considers the major factors in attitude change produced by means of social communication. As in the preceding volume, experiments are presented in considerable detail. This book goes a step further, however, by discussing both the methods of measuring personality factors and the theories underlying their research.

HOVLAND, C. I., I. L. JANIS, and H. H. KELLY. *Communication and Persuasion.* New Haven: Yale University Press, 1953.

This first volume in the Yale studies deals with the total situation in communication. The experiments, presented in this well-organized volume, are concerned with *who* (the communicator) says *what* (stimuli) to *whom* (audience) with what *effect* (audience response).

INSKO, CHESTER A. *Theories of Attitude Change.* New York: Appleton-Century-Crofts, 1967.

The question of how attitudes are changed is of vital concern to students of critical reading. However, proliferation of attitude change literature sometimes makes the study difficult. In answer to a growing need, Insko has prepared a systematic presentation of the extensive literature in the field of attitude change. Organized in terms of theories, each chapter presents a particular theory, related research, and an evaluation of both. Although the content is not always easily understood, the availability of the literature in a single volume compensates for its complexity.

KLAPPER, J. T. *The Effects of Mass Communication.* Glencoe, Ill.: Free Press, 1960.

A multitude of studies examining various effects of mass media on the reinforcement or conversion of attitudes are described in detail in this comprehensive summary of communication research. Taking a phenomenistic approach, the author considers the media as influences at work amid other factors in a total situation.

SMITH, M. B., J. S. BRUNNER, and R. W. WHITE. *Opinions and Personality.* New York: Wiley, 1956.

In a study of the psychological processes involved in forming and holding an opinion the authors have described in depth the opinions of ten men about an attitude object – Russia. Working from theory and using a convergence approach, the study examines strategies used by the subjects to minimize the disruptive effects of knowledge incongruent with their existing beliefs.

Articles

ANDERSON, LYNN R., and WILLIAM J. McGUIRE. "Prior Reassurance of Group Concensus as a Factor in Producing Resistance to Persuasion," *Sociometry,* Vol. 28, No. 1, 1965, 44-56.

Resistance to persuasion requires practice in defending beliefs. To stimulate belief defense and thus resistance to persuasion, it is necessary to threaten rather than reassure the believer. This serves to innoculate him (by pre-exposure) to weakened forms of the attacking arguments. It was found, as predicted, that more resistance to later persuasion is conferred by intrinsically threatening defenses than by completely reassuring them. Also, the immunizing efficacy of the defenses is weakened by giving the believer prior reassurance that his belief is true.

BETTS, EMMETT A. "Research on Reading as a Thinking Process," *Journal of Educational Research,* 50, 1956, 1-15.

In this succinct yet detailed presentation, Betts summarizes three doctoral dissertations by A. Sterl Artley, Ethel Maney, and Elona Sochor which explored the relationships between literal reading ability and the ability to read critically in content areas.

CARMENT, D. W., and C. G. MILES. "Persuasiveness and Persuasibility As Related to Intelligence and Extroversion," *British Journal of Social and Clinical Psychology,* Vol. 4, No. 1, 1965, 1-7.

Two specific variables – intelligence and extroversion – were the concern of this study. Results showed that the more intelligent and extroverted subjects were more able to persuade others and less likely to be persuaded by others.

COX, DONALD F., and RAYMOND A. BAUER. "Self-confidence and Persuasibility in Women," *Public Opinion Quarterly,* Vol. 28, No. 3, 1964, 453-466.

Reporting on a study of the relationship between persuasion and self-confidence, Cox and Bauer reveal the importance of the factor of confidence by showing that a confident persuader is apt to be more successful than one lacking in self-confidence.

CRANE, EDGAR. "Immunization – With and Without Use of Counterarguments," *Journalism Quarterly,* Vol. 39, No. 4 (Autumn 1962).

In antecedent experiments, a number of psychologists have established that presentation of a two-sided message (one containing counterarguments) will immunize a person's belief against subsequent propaganda. These experiments used cultural truisms as the beliefs being attacked and defended. Crane's study is especially relevant for our purposes because it establishes as one of its findings that the immunization effect of the two-sided message holds for more salient controversial issues. It is these issues, typical of mass media, with which educators are concerned.

CROSSEN, HELEN J. "Effects of the Attitudes of the Reader Upon Critical Reading Ability," *Journal of Educational Research,* 42, 1948, 289-298.

If there is a classic in educational research on the relationship between predisposition and critical reading ability, it must be this investigation. Working with ninth grade students, Crossen demonstrated the link between the two factors by showing that existing attitudes do affect interpretation of content.

DOBBS, JAMES M. J. "Self-esteem, Communicator Characteristics and Attitude Change," *Journal of Abnormal and Social Psychology,* Vol. 69, No. 2, 1964, 173-181.

Results of this academic study indicate that the opinion which a person has of himself has direct bearing on his evaluation of content and his responsiveness to certain types of communicators.

ELLER, WILLIAM, and JUDITH GOLDMAN WOLF. "Factors in Critical Reading," in Eric L. Thurston (Ed.), *The Philosophical and Sociological Basis of Reading,* Fourteenth Yearbook of the National Reading Conference, 64-72. Milwaukee, Wis.: National Reading Conference, 1965.

With emphasis on the qualities and characteristics of the source of a written message, the message itself and the recipient of the message, Eller and Wolf have examined research from the field of social psychology to broaden the scope of their scrutiny of the meaning of the critical process.

GROFF, P. J. "Children's Attitudes Toward Reading and Their Critical Reading Abilities in Four Content-Type Areas," *Journal of Educational Research,* 55 (April 1962), 313-319.

A positive relationship was found to exist between expressed attitudes of fifth and sixth grade subjects toward four different content type reading materials and their scores on an experimental test of critical reading. The test seemed to be comprised of higher level comprehension skills, thus suggesting a relationship between preference for a subject and ability to comprehend it.

HOVLAND, C. I., and H. A. PRITZKER. "Extent of Opinion Change as a Function of Amount of Change Advocated," *Journal of Abnormal and Social Psychology,* 54, 1957, 257-261.

Two factors relating to the critical reading process and examined in this study are the credibility of the source and the amount of opinion change suggested by the communication. Results indicate that when the communicator is highly credible, the greater the amount of change advocated, the greater the amount of change in beliefs.

JANIS, I. L., and S. FESHBACK. "Effects of Fear-Arousing Communications," *Journal of Abnormal and Social Psychology,* 48, 1953, 78-92.

The amount of fear present in a communication and the resultant amount of change in attitude and behavior is the concern of this widely known study. Three groups of high school students were presented with different versions of an illustrated lecture on dental hygiene. The presentations differed only in the intensity of the threat component in the illustrations. Contrary to the beliefs of many advertisers, minimum rather than maximum threat resulted in adoption of recommended procedures.

KISHLER, JOHN. "Prediction of Differential Learning from a Motion Picture By Means of Indices of Identification Potentials Derived from Attitudes Toward the Main Character," *American Psychologist,* 5, 1950, 298-299.

This thought-provoking study reveals that the supposed prestige of a source is an important variable in determining attitude change. The amount subjects learned from a motion picture was directly related to the degree of esteem in which they held the main character. In viewing "The Keys of the Kingdom," subjects learned readily from the character played by Gregory Peck because they believed that they were responding to a priest, whereas they were, in reality, responding to an actor.

McGUIRE, W. J., and D. PAPAGEORGIS. "Effectiveness of Forewarning in Developing Resistance to Persuasion," *Public Opinion Quarterly*, 26, 1962, 24-34.

For several years this team of psychologists has been involved in detailed examinations of various ways in which a person's beliefs can be made resistant to persuasion. This particular inquiry investigated the effect of various types of attack forewarning (varying conditions of telling a person that his belief will subsequently be exposed to strong attack) on resistance to persuasion. Forewarning in each of several settings reduced the efficacy of the verbal attack.

MANIS, M., and J. B. BLAKE. "Interpretation of Persuasive Messages as a Function of Prior Immunization," *Journal of Abnormal and Social Psychology*, 66, 1963, 225-230.

Three conditions were used to assess the effects of passive immunization (subjects given counter arguments) on interpretation of messages made by prestigeful sources. Some subjects were prepared for specific arguments which did later appear in a message advocating change in opinion; others were given rebuttals for specific arguments which did not later appear; and a third group were given no immunization. Those subjects who received immunization were less influenced by the communications and were able to maintain their positive stand. Contrary to prediction, however, immunized subjects showed greater tendency to displace the communicators away from their true positions. In this experiment and a later replication, the passive condition seems to have facilitated distortion resulting in an assimilation effect.

MANIS, M., and R. M. DAWES. "Cloze Score as a Function of Attitude," *Psychological Reports*, 9, 1961, 79-84.

The cloze technique was used to test the hypothesis that readers who disagree with the contents of a controversial statement will be relatively insensitive to the redundancy of the communicator's words. The results, directly related to critical reading, showed that regardless of the number of words deleted, subjects performed more efficiently when the passage echoed their views.

ROTT, ROBERT K., JERRY D. FEEZEL, and RONALD R. ALLEN. *A Study of Student Abilities in the Evaluation of Verbal Argument.* Madison: Research and Development Center for Cognitive Learning, University of Wisconsin, 1968.

Guided by *A Taxonomy of Concepts and Critical Abilities Related to the Evaluation of Verbal Arguments* (developed by Allen et al., and summarized elsewhere in this bibliography), Rott and his associates conducted a normative study of the critical thinking skills of secondary school students. Performances on Testimony and Reasoning tests were compared for adjacent grades from grade seven to grade twelve.

THAYER, LEE O., and N. H. PRONKO. "Factors Affecting Conceptual Perception in Reading," *Journal of General Psychology*, 61 (July 1959), 51-59.

After establishing a theoretical framework, the authors considered the problem of the influence of social forces on an individual's conceptualization in an ambiguous reading situation. One conclusion, that a reader in the absence or ambiguity of description will ascribe to a liked character traits, attitudes, and conditions he considers likeable and vice versa, illustrates the creatively biasing relationship between a reader and the material he reads.

WEISS, W. "Emotional Arousal and Attitude Change," *Psychological Reports*, 6, 1960, 267-280.

That type of content is a definite factor in the determination of response to a written statement was revealed in this experiment by Weiss. He found that subjects were more highly aroused by an emotional statement than they were by a rational statement.

Instructional Methodology

Books

GANS, ROMA. *A Study of Critical Reading Comprehension in the Intermediate Grades.* New York: Bureau of Publications, Teachers College, Columbia University, 1940.

In her pioneering study, Gans established the pattern of testing critical reading ability by requiring the examinee to differentiate between selections which are relevant or irrelevant in terms of an initial topic. She concluded that fourth, fifth, and sixth grade children in her sample had not learned to discern the authenticity or relevance of printed statements.

WOLF, WILLAVENE, CHARLOTTE S. HUCK, and MARTHA L. KING. *Critical Reading Ability of Elementary School Children.* Columbus: Ohio State University Research Foundation, 1967.

In what must be the most extensive study of the teaching of critical reading in elementary grades, Wolf and her associates have demonstrated that "children in grades one through six can learn to read critically" without any accompanying loss in other reading comprehension skills. In preparation for this federally sponsored research, the team at Ohio State developed a series of lessons for the teaching of critical reading skills and a set of tests to measure critical reading abilities in the elementary grades.

Articles

GLASER, EDWARD M. *An Experiment in the Development of Critical Thinking.* Teachers College, Columbia University, No. 843, 1941.

This old – but still relevant – study tested the assumption that the ability to think critically can be improved through instruction. A series of eight lesson units were developed and used with four twelfth grade English classes. Four additional twelfth grade English classes served as controls. After ten weeks the experimental groups showed greater gain on critical thinking tests than the control groups, thus supporting the initial assumption.

HYRAM, G. M. "Experiment in Developing Critical Thinking in Children," *Journal of Experimental Education,* 26 (December 1957), 125-132.

The question "Can critical thinking be taught?" is answered in the affirmative in this study. Thirty-three matched pairs of seventh graders, placed in experimental and control groups, participated in two programs for four months. The only known variable of relevance was the instruction given the experimental group in the development of eight broad understandings basic to conceptualization of logical thinking. Instruction resulted in a significant increase in reasoning ability for the experimental group.

NARDELLI, ROBERT R. "Some Aspects of Creative Reading," *Journal of Educational Research,* 50 (March 1957), 495-508.

Nardelli's study with eight groups of sixth grade pupils indicates that at least one area of critical reading – ability to recognize propaganda – can be improved through instruction. He also designed an instrument to measure facility with several critical reading skills.

PIEKARZ, JOSEPHINE A. "Getting Meaning From Reading," *Elementary School Journal,* 56 (March 1956), 303-309.

For some reason this study has received much attention even though it has serious design limitations. The case study method was used to compare two sixth grade subjects differing in their ability to read critically. Although the study provides us with some insight, the use of only two subjects – one boy and one girl – is a severe limitation.

THE TEACHING OF CRITICAL READING

Although not many total books are available on the subject of the teaching of critical thinking and reading, all of the four listed herein are commendable. The paperback volumes edited by Stauffer and by Wolf et al, each contain several excellent articles designed to help teachers, while the manuals edited by Dull provide an abundance of practical procedures for day-to-day use.

Books

DULL, LLOYD W. (Ed.). *Teaching Critical Thinking in the Elementary School.* Columbus: Ohio Education Association, 1964.

A committee of experienced Ohio educators produced what might be labeled an elementary teacher's manual for instruction in critical thinking and reading. Following the introductory chapter, which sets forth the general strategy for teaching critical thinking, there are six chapters which provide numerous suggestions for developing evaluative reading and thinking abilities in the several content and skills subjects of the elementary grades. Practical examples are provided in unusual abundance.

DULL, LLOYD W. (Ed.). *Teaching Critical Thinking in the Secondary School.* Columbus: Ohio Association for Supervision and Curriculum Development, 1964.

The first chapter of this manual offers several sets of "cookbook" criteria for teachers; in fact, it is identical to the introductory chapter of the handbook for elementary teachers (described above). However, the remaining five chapters provide numerous practical examples and suggestions for teaching critical thinking and reading in high school English, social studies, science, mathematics, and the arts.

KING, MARTHA L., BERNICE D. ELLINGER, and WILLAVENE WOLF (Eds.), *Critical Reading.* Philadelphia: Lippincott, 1967.

The largest section of this 450 page paperback book of readings is devoted to the teaching of critical reading. In addition there are segments which focus upon 1) the nature of critical reading, 2) relationships with other types of mental activity, and 3) research on critical reading. For anyone seeking a broad view of the topic of critical reading, this is probably the most useful single volume.

STAUFFER, RUSSELL G. (Comp.). *Dimensions of Critical Reading,* Proceedings of the Annual Education and Reading Conferences, 11. Newark, Del., University of Delaware, 1964.

Except for one misplaced article on the role of interest in reading, the 169 pages of this yearbook offer a surprisingly good collection of presentations on

critical reading. Particularly noteworthy are the introductory survey by Helen M. Robinson, and the chapters by John A. Brown on concept development, by E. Paul Torrance on developing creative readers, and by Ethel Maw on teaching critical thinking.

Articles

ELLER, WILLIAM. "Improving Critical Reading," in Clay A. Ketcham (Ed.), *College Reading Association,* 5, 43-46. Easton, Pennsylvania. Fall 1964.

Using graphic examples from adult literature, Eller presents a strong case for the improvement of critical reading abilities at the adult level. Unlike many authors, however, he does not stop there but proceeds with practical suggestions for achieving his aim. Although written mainly for high school and college instructors, any interested teacher looking for a way to implement the teaching of critical reading will find a starting place in this straightforward article.

MAW, ETHEL W. "Teaching Critical Thinking Through Reading" in Russell G. Stauffer (Ed.), *Dimensions of Critical Reading,* 11, 75-87. Newark, Del.: University of Delaware, 1964.

This extremely meaty discussion of various aspects of critical thinking is directed to teachers of all subject areas of the curriculum. Having once established that the teaching of critical thinking is the concern of all educators, the author next illustrates each skill with examples from various content areas. The final segment of the article describes factors which may affect the child's ability to think critically and offers some useful suggestions for dealing with these factors in the classroom.

HUELSMAN, CHARLES B., JR. "Problems Met When Reading Critically in Grades Seven to Ten," in M. Jerry Weiss (Ed.), *Reading in the Secondary Schools.* New York: Odyssey Press, 1961, 226-231.

In a simple, straightforward manner the author describes and evaluates three current approaches to the teaching of critical reading. A fairly detailed list of skills and pitfalls involved in critical reading precedes these descriptions and is perhaps the most useful aspect of the entire article.

STAUFFER, RUSSELL G. "Reading and the Educated Guess," in *Reading and Thinking,* a report of the Seventeenth Annual Conference and Course on Reading. Pittsburgh: University of Pittsburgh Press, 1961, 27-33.

Stauffer, who has written extensively on aspects of reading comprehension, explains the role and importance of skill in making reasonable predictions and defensible explanations as a tool of evaluation in reading. Included are several examples of "educated guessing" in elementary school reading situations.